

## Final Review Report

### Deliverable Description

Date: 26.12.2011

**Project Title:** Enhancing the System of Civil Service in Turkmenistan

**Project Number:** 00074321

**Project Outcome:** Strengthen democratization and the rule of law.

**Implementing Agency:** Civil Service Academy under the President of Turkmenistan

**Reporting Period:** 2010 –2011

The project has two distinct objectives: i) Contribute to improvement of the legal framework for civil service; and ii) Support institutional development of the Academy for civil service to carry out successful programmes of teaching and training of civil servants. The project envisages cooperation with the Academy for Civil Service of Turkmenistan with the objective of (a) reviewing and analyzing its structure and mandate with consequent design of short, mid and long term action plan; (b) designing and introducing a new curriculum on public administration, (c) developing and sustaining cooperative relations between similar academic and training institutions in Europe and CIS and (d) conducting a series of short term training courses on subjects of national priorities.

### Identifier (Activity ID)

1. Improve the legal framework for civil servants in partnership and consultations with key national stakeholders;
2. Develop the institutional capacity of the Academy;
3. Assist CSA to design and introduce a new Public Administration program;
4. Assist CSA to develop cooperate relations with academic and training institutions within the CIS and Europe;
5. Provide modern methodologies and techniques for developing training curricula for various categories of civil servants;
6. Conduct a series of short term coerces delivered by senior UNDP officials;
7. Promote e-governance in public administration;
8. Organize and hold a national conference with participation of international experts to discuss prospects of further enhancing the public administration system;
9. Promoting e-governance in public administration through, and including, the interaction with the Coordination Commission on introduction of ICT to public administration;
10. Improvement of the teaching capacity of the CSA.

### Deliverable Descriptions

#### 2010

Package of national legal documents regulating civil service system, detailed analysis of existing legislation on civil service and proposals for adoption of new laws are prepared to provide a basis for further activities in improvement of the legal framework.

CSA identified its development priorities and designed a roadmap with clear development steps to be undertaken.

In order to enhance its information dissemination activities CSA has started work on designing its future website. The shaping of the website has been completed. Website hosting activities and training of 1 staff to administer the website are pending.

CSA drafted five year development plan outlining activities for the short and long terms to build up the CSA institutional development.

20 students and 10 teachers learned to conduct SWOT analysis through participation in the vision and goals determining exercise.

10 professors and 80 students expanded their knowledge of contemporary trends in public administration reforms. CSA upgraded its knowledge and understanding of international quality standards in teaching Public Administration.

CSA designed the curriculum outline of Public Administration training program in conformity with international standards.

CSA possesses the list of institutions with the names and contact details of academies of public administration, public administration associations, public administration journals.

CSA has a database of available reading materials (textbooks) on public administration to order and purchase.

CSA possesses the list of institutions with the names and contact details of academies of public administration, public administration associations, public administration journals. CSA drafted an invitation letter proposing establishment of cooperation and TOR for transparent selection of professors. The mechanism of inviting foreign professors is being worked out.

## Final Review Report

### Deliverable Description

Date: 26.12.2011

Experts in human development, e-governance, e-documentation, public administration, information security and curricula development were invited to:

Deliver workshops and training for CSA faculty and students in these fields

Enhance the teaching capacity by developing interactive and independent teaching and learning techniques, assessment methods, student-centered learning;

Design curriculum of e-governance, and Public Administration training program

30 CSA representatives, including core staff and students, have been empowered in human development concepts, current trends and significance for national development during a 5-day HD course, learned that the level of human development is assessed from different aspects of life as, for instance, human security, expansion of rights and opportunities, health, education, access to ICT, etc. As a result, the Academy decided to introduce HD training course into the CSA curriculum.

100 participants of the HDR 2010 Launch event, representing the Turkmen parliament, ministries and specialized institutes, state universities and academies, youth and women's associations, and state media increased their awareness of Turkmenistan's progress in improving HDI. The Turkmen Government committed to continue taking active steps in all areas of human development.

CSA's 10 faculty members and 80 students became aware of the benefits, best practices, architecture and challenges of and international experience in introducing e-governance in public administration; they have realized the importance of e-governance and e-government for improving human development indices.

80 civil servants introduced themselves to the working procedure of EDM (electronic document management system);

The Interdepartmental Commission on introduction of e-documentation in public administration revised and updated the e-documentation introduction policies in accordance with recommendations of international experts;

CSA and Interdepartmental Commission agreed to open a training centre to teach government officials practice e-documentation using the software left by the consultant;

CSA has been supported with the design of a 5-month e-governance curriculum to be taught starting from next academic year.

### 2011

National conference titled "International experience and prospects of further public administration reforms in Turkmenistan" was conducted on 30 June 2011. Four international experts, including two professors from the Russian Civil Service Academy and Belarusian Academy of Public Administration, participated in the conference and provided expertise on international experience in reforming public administration systems and training civil servants.

The conference gathered about sixty participants representing the government ministries and departments, Mejlis of Turkmenistan, national research institutions, public associations and mass media. While discussing the ongoing national legislative reforms and public administration initiatives as well as training of professional civil servants, the participants were also exposed to the international experience of enhancing public administration, best practices and challenges in improving local self-governance in Central and Eastern European and CIS countries, pros and cons of such elements of public administration reform as developing public-private partnerships and outsourcing. In addition, the mid-level managers of the government entities attending the conference were introduced to the experience of Russia in public sector management reform as well as to the practices exercised by the Academy of Public Administration under the aegis of the President of the Republic of Belarus in training civil servants for Belarusian public administration system.

Working meeting with the Ministry of Economy and Development, which chairs the State Commission on ICT Introduction was conducted to discuss the initiation of strategy.

A MS Word and Power Point explanation and description of how to use the software on electronic document management system was prepared by one staff of the Academy and left for further presentation among teachers of the Academy. The document describes all necessary processes of e-document flows. The students of the Academy are expected to practice e-documentation during the training process in the Academy.

Non-Disclosure Agreement received from ICDL Foundation and was sent for consideration to Legal Support Office in New York. The comments and recommendations of the LSO were forwarded to the ECDL Foundation. Following rounds of negotiations, LSO and ECDL foundation did not agree on the content of the Non-Disclosure Agreement and therefore the ICDL certification was not conducted.

A local consultant to design a teaching manual for the course "E-governance for development" was selected. The first draft of the teaching manual was developed in August.

International consultant to provide expert assessment of the manual was selected and the visit to Ashgabat organized. As part of the visit of international expert, the following activities were conducted:

## Final Review Report

### Deliverable Description

Date: 26.12.2011

- Consultation with management and staff of the Civil Service Academy on adaptation of teaching manual "E-governance based on participation" into curriculum Academy;
- Two round-tables for teachers of the Civil Service Academy on e-governance;
- Three-day workshops for listeners of the Civil Service Academy on topic: "E-government, international experience and national practice."

A local consultant to design a teaching manual for the course "Human Development" was selected. The first draft of the teaching manual was prepared in mid August and sent to BRC policy advisors on human development to obtain their expert assessment.

The visit of Human Development Policy Analyst from Bratislava Regional Centre was organized to finalize the course on human development. The visit included the following activities:

- Consultation with management and staff of the Civil Service Academy on adaptation of teaching manual "Human development";
- Organization of three-day workshop for listeners of the Civil Service Academy on topic: "Human development".

Efforts were made to conduct lectures at Civil Service Academy by international experts, visiting Turkmenistan within the frameworks of other projects and initiatives. A lecture on international electoral standards was conducted by visiting international expert on electoral standards.

---

### Lessons learned:

The interventions under the project contributed to enhancing the institutional capacity of the Academy of Civil Service, UNDP's main implementing partner. In particular, the Academy's core staff (10 people) and its students (200 people) that represent various government structures, including bodies of self-governance, upgraded their knowledge in such areas as governance, public management and administration, especially, enriching themselves in such concepts as human development, e-governance and e-government, information security, electronic document management systems and international public administration reform issues. They expanded their outlooks by learning international experiences, best practices and challenges in improving public administration systems. Over 100 civil servants that attended the HDR 2010 Launch event on November 5 became aware of human development issues, international efforts in improving living standards and creating greater opportunities for better education, healthcare, etc.

Owing to the project, the Academy of Civil Service has devised the long term action plan aimed at turning the Academy into the leading knowledge-based agency providing high quality civil servants training, devised a list of international experts in and institutions of public administration, improved its public relations and upgraded its curricula. The Academy is in the process of finding a sustainable mechanism of establishing cooperative relations with similar foreign academies and institutions of public administration for future academic exchanges and teaching. Lack of sufficient funding is a serious constraint in realizing this objective that will continue to remain a challenge in the near future.

Initial steps were undertaken to launch activities aimed at improvement of Turkmen civil service legislation. To this end, analysis of the legal framework regulating civil service in Turkmenistan and the package of legal acts and laws were prepared. However, further activities under the policy level planned for the fourth quarter of the year, were not organized due to the extremely busy schedule of the government connected with economic and political activities and events that could result in low profile attendance not producing tangible results. This activity, depending on the availability of financing, will be facilitated during the next projects.

Promoting e-governance in public administration has been challenged by inconsistent policies and structural issues. In the absence of a state institution, clearly mandated to take the lead in promoting ICT and e-governance, working in this area was very difficult. In addition to this, difficulties in signing legal document prevented the project from adapting and piloting international certification of ICT skills of civil servants with the use of ICDL. Academy's own capacity development efforts were limited by small number of staff.

---

Final Review Report

Deliverable Description

Date: 26.12.2011

Risk Log

#	Description	Date Identified	Type	Impact & Probability	Countermeasures / Mngt response	Owner	Submitted, updated by	Last Update	Status
	Enter a brief description of the risk  <i>(In Atlas, use the Description field. Note: This field cannot be modified after first data entry)</i>	When was the risk first identified  <i>(In Atlas, select date. Note: date cannot be modified after initial entry)</i>	Environmental Financial Operational Organizational Political Regulatory Strategic Other Subcategories for each risk type should be consulted to understand each risk type (see Deliverable Description for more information)  <i>(In Atlas, select from list)</i>	Describe the potential effect on the project if this risk were to occur  Enter probability on a scale from 1 (low) to 5 (high) P =  Enter impact on a scale from 1 (low) to 5 (high) I =  <i>(In Atlas, use the Management Response box. Check "critical" if the impact and probability are high)</i>	What actions have been taken/will be taken to counter this risk  <i>(In Atlas, use the Management Response box. This field can be modified at any time. Create separate boxes as necessary using "+", for instance to record updates at different times)</i>	Who has been appointed to keep an eye on this risk  <i>(In Atlas, use the Management Response box)</i>	Who submitted the risk  <i>(In Atlas, automatically recorded)</i>	When was the status of the risk last checked  <i>(In Atlas, automatically recorded)</i>	e.g. dead, reducing, increasing, no change  <i>(In Atlas, use the Management Response box)</i>
1	Delay to hold a national conference on international experience and best practices of public administration reform due to lack of initiative from the Turkmen side.	March 15, 2011	Organizational Strategic	The Project will be unable to implement Indicator 1 "Legal/normative framework for civil service management improved" of AWP. The Academy will not be in line with modern trends in public administration reform processes P = 3 I = 4	The Rector and leading professors were encouraged to submit proposals as for the agenda of the conference.	Project Manager	Project Manager	30 June, 2011	The Conference finally conducted, after getting required approvals at the level of Cabinet of Ministers.
2	Failure to initiate discussions on e-gov strategy development due to the Coordination Commissioner's inactive Interdepartmental Working Group.	March 13, 2011	Strategic Operational	The Turkmen side will not be aware of best practices in implementing e-government, will lag behind the universal common trends of introducing e-gov strategies and will not improve its public administration system. P = 3 I = 4	The member of Interdepartmental working Group was asked to be more active and promote discussion of this issue at UNDAF meeting March 31, 2011.	Project Manager	Project Manager	30 May 2011	No change
3	No teaching manual on the use of e-documentation will be developed due to	March 12, 2011	Operational	The Academy will not be able to teach its students practice e-documentation, which is critical for new generation of	The project provides all its resources in order to assist the Academy in this endeavour. Contacts with	Project Manager	Project Manager	30 August 2011 The CSA is drafting a WORD paper	The document was prepared and left with the Academy staff

Final Review Report

Date: 26.12.2011

Deliverable Description

4						inability to run the software																																																																																																																																																			

Final Review Report

Date: 26.12.2011

Deliverable Description

---

**Accountabilities (USD):**

Budget:

2010 – 122,255

2011 – 92,900

Expenditures:

64,769.72

57,835

**TOTAL BUDGET: 215,155**

**TOTAL EXPENDITURES: 122,604.72**

Hajimurad Pirmuhamedov  
Project Manager

